

## Message Text

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 01 STATE 114584  
ORIGIN EB-07

INFO OCT-01 AF-10 ARA-10 EA-09 EUR-12 NEA-10 ISO-00  
IO-13 CAB-05 CIAE-00 COME-00 DODE-00 DOTE-00  
INR-07 NSAE-00 EPG-02 FAA-00 INRE-00 SSO-00 /086 R

DRAFTED BY EB/OA/AVP:JSGRAVATT:PMA  
APPROVED BY EB/OA/AVP:AJWHITE  
IO/TRC:CHARTLEY  
FAA:NPLUMMER

-----182231Z 070366 /21

O 182136Z MAY 77  
FM SECSTATE WASHDC  
TO AMCONSUL MONTREAL IMMEDIATE

UNCLAS STATE 114584

E.O. 11652: N/A

TAGS: EAIR, ICAO, PORG

SUBJECT: ICAO: STATEMENT BY FRANK L. FRISBIE,U.S.  
AWO PANEL MEMBER

FOLLOWING IS FRISBIE'S STATEMENT FOR USE AS US REP SEES  
FIT:

"I HAVE READ AWOP-WP/331 WHICH WAS PRESENTED BY M.F.  
WHITNEY AND PUBLISHED AND DISTRIBUTED BY ICAO. THE  
PAPER IS ENTITLED "PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT - MISREPRESENTA-  
TION OF THE BRUSSELS AIRPORT SCENARIO IN AWOP-WP/321."

I AM NATURALLY DISAPPOINTED BY THE TONE AND APPARENT  
INTENT OF THAT PAPER. IT DISCREDITS THE PANEL'S WORK  
AND PROFESSIONAL INTEGRITY OF THE ORGANIZATION THAT  
CONTRIBUTED TO THE PROGRAM, AND INEVITABLY GENERATES  
DISCORD BY ARGUING AN IRRELEVANT DETAIL.

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 STATE 114584

I DO NOT WISH TO PARTICIPATE IN OR EXTEND SUCH AN  
IRRELEVANT ARGUMENT, BUT INASMUCH AS AWOP-WP/331 HAS  
BEEN PUBLISHED AND DISTRIBUTED AFTER THE FACT TO THE  
PANEL MEMBERS, THE AIR NAVIGATION COMMISSION, AND THE  
PUBLIC, I AM OBLIGED TO TAKE THIS ONE STEP TO COUNTER  
THIS ASSERTION.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS SHOULD BE UNDERSTOOD BY THE RECIPIENTS OF AWOP-WP/331:

1. THE COMPUTER SIMULATION OF A SCENARIO BASED ON BRUSSELS AIRPORT WAS PRESENTED TO THE WORKING GROUP IN NOVEMBER 1976, AND TO THE PANEL IN MARCH 1977, TO ILLUSTRATE A PRINCIPLE, NOT TO PREDICT THE PRECISE RESULTS THAT MAY BE OBTAINED AT THE AIRPORT. THE CONCLUSIONS DRAWN FROM THAT STIMULATION STUDY ARE GENERAL IN NATURE AND REFER TO A BASIC PRINCIPLE WHICH IS STILL NOT QUESTIONED: BUILDING ORIENTATIONS ON AIRPORTS CAN GENERATE DMLS REFERENCE SCALLOPING AND RESULT IN DMLS AZIMUTH ERRORS. IN FACT, WHEN THE PANEL DRAFTED THE CONCLUSION ON THIS ISSUE, IT CHOSE THE WORDS "POSSIBLE BUILDING ORIENTATIONS," AND THUS, IT IS EVIDENT THAT THE MAJORITY OF THE PANEL MEMBERS WERE NOT CONCERNED WITH ANY NEED FOR STARK REALISM IN THE COMPUTER SIMULATION OF A SPECIFIC AIRPORT THAT ILLUSTRATED THIS DEFICIENCY IN DMLS.

2. THE OFFICIAL AIRPORT CHARTS AVAILABLE WHEN THE COMPUTER SIMULATION WAS CONDUCTED (FIRST IN EARLY NOVEMBER 1976) CLEARLY SHOWED THE EXISTENCE OF THREE LONG BUILDINGS ORIENTED IN SUCH A MANNER TO CREATE A POTENTIAL PROBLEM WITH DMLS. ONE OF THE MOST RECENT CHARTS, PUBLISHED LATER HAS BEEN CHANGED TO SHOW ONLY TWO SUCH BUILDINGS, BUT OTHER CHARTS PUBLISHED AS LATE AS FEBRUARY 1977 CONTINUE TO SHOW THREE BUILDINGS.

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 03 STATE 114584

3. TO OBTAIN INFORMATION FOR THIS SIMULATION STUDY, LOCAL PERSONNEL IN BRUSSELS WERE ASKED TO PROVIDE INFORMATION ON BUILDING HEIGHTS AND SURFACE MATERIAL, WHICH THEY DID VERBALLY, BUT DUE TO SOME CONFUSION THE EXISTENCE OF THE BUILDINGS SHOWN ON OFFICIAL AIRPORT CHARTS WAS NOT CORRECTLY VERIFIED. WE PROCEEDED AT AWOP-6 ON THE ASSUMPTION THAT THE EARLY AIP CHARTS CORRECTLY DEPICTED EXISTING BUILDINGS. UPON RECEIPT OF WP/331, I LEARNED THAT ONLY TWO OF THE THREE BUILDINGS EXIST. HOWEVER, INQUIRY REVEALS THAT A POTENTIALLY "OFFENSIVE" BUILDING DOES EXIST AT BRUSSELS, BUT IT IS A DIFFERENT ONE OF THE THREE THAT WAS FIRST UNDERSTOOD - AND THAT ONE OF THE THREE BUILDINGS SHOWN ON THE CHARTS WAS APPARENTLY PLANNED, BUT NOT YET CONSTRUCTED.

4. NONE OF THE COMPUTER SIMULATIONS PRESENTED TO THE PANEL ATTEMPTS TO PREDICT EXACT RESULTS THAT WOULD BE ACHIEVED AT ANY SPECIFIC AIRPORT. ALL THESE SIMULATIONS

ILLUSTRATED POSSIBLE CONSEQUENCES UNDER CIRCUMSTANCES WHICH ARE POSSIBLE WHEN THE NEW SYSTEM IS IMPLEMENTED SOMETIME IN THE FUTURE. CONSEQUENTLY, AN ARGUMENT OVER THE ACCURACY OF AN EXISTING AIRPORT CHART, OR OVER THE EXISTENCE OF ANY SPECIFIC BUILDING ON ANY AIRPORT TODAY IS IRRELEVANT AND TRIVIAL.

5. AWOP-WP/331 DOES NOT DENY THE EXISTENCE OF THE ERROR MECHANISM IN THE DMLS DESIGN, NOR DOES IT DENY THAT THE CIRCUMSTANCES SIMULATED ARE POSSIBLE CIRCUMSTANCES THAT MAY BE ENCOUNTERED IN THE FUTURE. IN FACT, TEST DATA SUBMITTED WITH THE DMLS PROPOSAL SHOW THAT LARGE ERRORS CAN OCCUR UNDER GIVEN CIRCUMSTANCES. THE POSSIBILITIES FOR ENCOUNTERING THIS PROBLEM WITH DMLS CAN BE RECOGNIZED AND UNDERSTOOD BY STUDYING THE PROPOSED DMLS DESIGN AND TEST DATA AND COMPUTER SIMULATION IS NOT NECESSARY FOR THIS PURPOSE. THE COMPUTER SIMULA-  
UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 04 STATE 114584

TION SIMPLY GENERATES INFORMATION PICTORIALY TO ILLUSTRATE A SAMPLE CIRCUMSTANCE WHEN THE DMLS ERROR WILL OCCUR. THUS, IT IS INCORRECT TO CLAIM THAT THE COMPUTER PREDICTIONS ARE ENTIRELY LACKING IN PROOF." CHRISTOPHER

UNCLASSIFIED

NNN

## Message Attributes

**Automatic Decaptioning:** X  
**Capture Date:** 01-Jan-1994 12:00:00 am  
**Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Current Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED  
**Concepts:** PUBLICATIONS, PERSONAL OPINION, CIVIL AVIATION  
**Control Number:** n/a  
**Copy:** SINGLE  
**Sent Date:** 18-May-1977 12:00:00 am  
**Decaption Date:** 01-Jan-1960 12:00:00 am  
**Decaption Note:**  
**Disposition Action:** n/a  
**Disposition Approved on Date:**  
**Disposition Case Number:** n/a  
**Disposition Comment:**  
**Disposition Date:** 01-Jan-1960 12:00:00 am  
**Disposition Event:**  
**Disposition History:** n/a  
**Disposition Reason:**  
**Disposition Remarks:**  
**Document Number:** 1977STATE114584  
**Document Source:** CORE  
**Document Unique ID:** 00  
**Drafter:** JSGRAVATT:PMA  
**Enclosure:** n/a  
**Executive Order:** N/A  
**Errors:** N/A  
**Expiration:**  
**Film Number:** D770177-0384  
**Format:** TEL  
**From:** STATE  
**Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Image Path:**  
**ISecure:** 1  
**Legacy Key:** link1977/newtext/t19770542/aaaabkat.tel  
**Line Count:** 143  
**Litigation Code IDs:**  
**Litigation Codes:**  
**Litigation History:**  
**Locator:** TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM  
**Message ID:** f0545e90-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc  
**Office:** ORIGIN EB  
**Original Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED  
**Original Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Original Previous Classification:** n/a  
**Original Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Page Count:** 3  
**Previous Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Previous Classification:** n/a  
**Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Reference:** n/a  
**Retention:** 0  
**Review Action:** RELEASED, APPROVED  
**Review Content Flags:**  
**Review Date:** 25-Jan-2005 12:00:00 am  
**Review Event:**  
**Review Exemptions:** n/a  
**Review Media Identifier:**  
**Review Release Date:** n/a  
**Review Release Event:** n/a  
**Review Transfer Date:**  
**Review Withdrawn Fields:** n/a  
**SAS ID:** 2463284  
**Secure:** OPEN  
**Status:** NATIVE  
**Subject:** ICAO: STATEMENT BY FRANK L. FRISBIE, U.S. AWO PANEL MEMBER FOLLOWING IS FRISBIE'S STATEMENT FOR USE AS US REP  
**TAGS:** EAIR, PORG, CA, ICAO, (FRISBIE, FRANK L)  
**To:** MONTREAL  
**Type:** TE  
**vdkgvwkey:** odb://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS\_Docs/f0545e90-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc  
**Review Markings:**  
Margaret P. Grafeld  
Declassified/Released  
US Department of State  
EO Systematic Review  
22 May 2009  
**Markings:** Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009